

YURIY LUKIN

Senior Professor, Department of Theory
and History of State and Law, Project
Chairman of the Student Scientific Society
of the Law Faculty, Kazan (Volga region)
Federal University

NIKITA MAKOLKIN

Master student, Chairman of the Student
Scientific Society of the Law Faculty,
Kazan (Volga region) Federal University

**REVIEW
OF THE XV ANNUAL STUDENT MODEL TRIAL
“ALL-RUSSIAN JUDICIAL DEBATES 2019”**

DOI: 10.30729/2541-8823-2019-4-2-136-144

Abstract: The article tells about the student model trial “All-Russian Judicial Debates”, which was held at the Law Faculty of Kazan (Volga Region) Federal University on 19-20 April 2019. The article highlights the main stages in the emergence of the Debate idea. It reveals topical issues of legal reality, raised in the framework of the event, and also outlines the results, which were reached at the discussion of these legal issues. In addition, the scientific-educational and scientific-practical components of the project are discussed. In addition to the above, the article tells not only about debates at the Law Faculty of KFU, but also about the functioning of the “schools” of debates at the law faculties of Russian universities. Further, the article mentions the researchers and representatives of the judicial and law enforcement system, who are not only judges of the competition, but are long-term partners and friends of the project.

Keywords: Law Faculty of Kazan (Volga Region) Federal University, All-Russian Judicial Debates, student self-government, student scientific society, conference, debates.

On 19-20 April 2019, for the fifteenth time the Law Faculty of the Kazan (Volga Region) Federal University opened its doors to students from all over Russia, who participated in a project that is essentially unique – the All-Russian Judicial Debates. The purpose of the All-Russian Judicial Debates is to understand the problems of legal reality in the field of national law, strengthen relations with Russian universities, share theoretical and practical knowledge in the field of jurisprudence, and prepare students to participate in real trials as close as possible to the real “combat” situation. Events of this kind, in addition to these goals, perform another very important and relevant function – they increase the level of professional competence of future graduates. This idea is supported by the fact that this form of education is as practice-oriented as possible, and therefore it increases the competitiveness of participating students.

The Law Faculty of Kazan University is rapidly developing as a center of classical legal education, talented scientists and scientific breakthroughs of modern jurisprudence. The foundation of Kazan Law School was initially formed at the intersection of theory and practice, a proportionate combination of the educational process and the research work of teachers and students. Currently, the faculty is actively promoting the idea of improving the quality of education of students through their participation in research activities. The research work of the students of the faculty in a way is a “workshop” of young scientists, a guarantee of their successful professional training.

One of such forms of research activity is the annual large-scale event for the legal community – All-Russian Judicial Debates. The interaction of Kazan Federal University with leading higher educational institutions of the country, the dynamics of legal processes in the field of national law, as well as the development of civil, criminal, administrative and constitutional legal procedures create good conditions for conducting a student moot court “All-Russian Judicial Debates”.

These debates are the “founder” of such projects for law students. This format of research and practical activities goes beyond the traditional conferences, forums, seminars and other similar events. All-Russian Judicial Debates make the process of teaching students more effective, interesting, lively and as close as possible to their future profession.

All-Russian Judicial Debates have their origins back in 2005. Then the debates were held only on the basis of the Faculty of Law of Kazan State University named after V.I. Ulyanov-Lenin at the time, and were held for the students of the Faculty, but already then the great prospects for this project became apparent. Already in 2006, students could try themselves in the new direction of Debate – in criminal proceedings.

The implementation of this direction in the Project involved new coaches, new participants and new judges. Thus, the training of the teams of Kazan University in this area became the responsibility of the Department of Criminal Procedure and Forensic Science of the Law Faculty. Under the leadership of the Head of the Department *Igor Olegovich Antonov* and with the support of the lecturers of the Department *Marina Evgenievna Klyukova* and *Marat Minifetovich Shamsutdinov*, more than one generation of

good debaters were raised. Such debaters do not only defend the honor of the department and the university, but also successfully realize themselves in their professional life.

Also, since 2006 the Judicial Debates have acquired the status of All-Russian, gathering the best students of the country each year in April, which undoubtedly marked a new round in the history of the Debates.

Further, the story takes another turn, and since 2010 based on the results of the model trial, a book of All-Russian Judicial Debates containing the legal positions of the participating teams is being issued.

Since 2016, two more areas have emerged in the structure of the Judicial Debates – Constitutional Justice and Civil Justice in the Courts of General Jurisdiction.

In 2017 for the first time a section entitled “Trade Union Debates” was held – a model process on social and educational law, the purpose of which was to develop and identify students’ knowledge and practical skills on educational law.

The year 2019 was marked by another change. The debates “lost” the section of Civil Proceedings in the courts of general jurisdiction, it was merged again with the section of Civil Proceedings. Simultaneously with this “loss”, the contest acquired a new direction, and became the first and only one in Russia where students can try to test their knowledge and skills in the Administrative Procedure section, where the trials are held according to the general rules of the event and with the use of the rules of the new Code of Administrative Procedure of the Russian Federation.

Throughout the long history of Debates, scientific debate schools have appeared all over Russia. So the representatives of Kazan School of Debates were the mentors of the participating teams: *Yury Mikhailovich Lukin*, Advocate of the Bar of the Republic of Tatarstan, head of scientific research work of students of the Law Faculty of Kazan University, Senior Lecturer of the Department of Theory and History of State and Law; *Marat Vladimirovich Fetyukhin*, Honored Lawyer of the Republic of Tatarstan, Candidate of Legal Sciences, Associate Professor of the Department of Environmental, Labor Law and Civil Procedure at the Law Faculty of Kazan Federal University; *Marina Evgenievna Klyukova*, Honored Lawyer of the Republic of Tatarstan, Candidate of Legal Sciences, Associate Professor of the Department of Criminal Procedure and Forensics at the Law Faculty of Kazan Federal University. The representative of Rostov School of Debates was *Elena Sergeevna Smagina*, an expert of the Constitutional Court of the Russian Federation and the Supreme Court of the Russian Federation, Candidate of Legal Sciences, Associate Professor of the Southern Federal University. Saratov School of Debates was represented by *Mikhail Yuryevich Lebedev*, Candidate of Legal Sciences, Associate Professor of Saratov State Law Academy. The school of Debates of Yekaterinburg was represented by *Evgeniya Rudolfovna Rusinova*, Candidate of Legal Sciences, Associate professor of the Department of Civil Process at the Ural State Law University. Among others were *Natalia Gennadyevna Narbikova*, Candidate of Legal Sciences, Associate Professor, Head of the Department of Criminal Law and Law Faculty of Orenburg State Agrarian University; *Elena Alexandrovna Borisova*,

Doctor of Legal Sciences, Professor of the Department of Civil Procedure of Moscow State University; *Oksana Nikolaevna Yurgel*, Senior Lecturer of the Department of Civil Law and Procedure of the National Research Lobachevsky State University of Nizhni Novgorod; *Inna Viktorovna Kosheleva*, Advocate, Senior Lecturer at the Department of Criminal Procedure Law and Criminology, Volga-Vyatka Institute (branch) of the Kutafin University (MSLA).

Understanding the need to give a better start to the junior students, *Yury Mikhailovich Lukin* founded the club “Judicial Debates. Junior League”, which is a launching pad for the future lawyers, future debaters. The preparation and participation of newly enrolled students of the Faculty became not just an element of maintaining the prestige of Kazan school of debates, but also acts as a real part of the educational process and an objective need for practice-oriented work among students.

In addition, the Student Scientific Club “Judicial Debates” operates at the Faculty, which also functions under the guidance of *Yuri Lukin*.

Speaking about the coaches of the teams of the Civil Law branch of Kazan Law School, it is worth noting that *Yuri Mikhailovich*, being a practicing lawyer, does not just prepare students for the “adult life” and participation in debates. He shares his knowledge and professional secrets, interesting and funny cases from his practice, tactics of speaking in court, tactics of presenting your position, as well as his rich experience. Therefore, touching on the issue of preparation, it is more correct to speak about the preparation of a worthy new generation, about maintaining elitism and prestige of the profession and the title “Lawyer”. However, it is impossible to talk about the coach and his contribution without mentioning what his students have become. The graduates of the club “Judicial Debates” today occupy leading positions in the largest law firms in Russia, they can be managing partners or remain at the Faculty and transfer the gained knowledge to new students, they also become representatives of the judiciary, executive and legislative branches.

However it is worth mentioning that graduating from the university or club does not mean breaking connections and contacts. Both the coach and the debaters will forever remain one big strong family, each member of which is ready at any moment to give advice, to share new experience and to support.

It is necessary to emphasize that both real and model trials cannot do without decent judging. Every year, the leading experts of jurisprudence are invited as judges: scientists, lecturer, judges, prosecutors, lawyers, legal advisers and others. Traditionally, the judges for the sections are the following experts: Professor of the Ural State Legal University *Dmitry Borisovich Abushenko*, Doctor of Legal Sciences; judge emeritus *Vyacheslav Yuryevich Gussyakov*, Candidate of Legal Sciences, Senior Lecturer of SamSU; Professor *Kuzbagarov Askhat Nazargalievich*, Doctor of Legal Sciences; Associate Professor of Moscow State University *Sergey Vladimirovich Moiseev*; solicitor *Andrey Alekseevich Pavlov*, Candidate of Legal Sciences; judges of the Supreme Court of the Republic of Tatarstan: *Rafail Valiyevich Sakiryanov*, *Eduard Ilsiyanovich Abdullin*, *Radik Shamilevich*

Adiyatullin, Ramil Gapteraufovich Bikmiev; Head of the Military Prosecutor's Office of Kazan garrison *Sergey Vladimirovich Gorb*.

Moreover, the representatives of the business community are invited as guests who may become future employers of promising talented young lawyers participating in the All-Russian Judicial Debates. The annual participation of students from leading universities of Russia, a professional judiciary, and an excellent event organization with an exciting finale make the All-Russian Judicial Debates a unique scientific project.

Thus, students of the best universities, academies and institutes of Russia meet annually in Kazan to try themselves in five areas: civil proceedings in commercial (arbitration) courts, civil proceedings in courts of general jurisdiction, criminal proceedings, constitutional proceedings and the trade union section. Each university that took part in this event was represented by one or several teams in each area. The All-Russian judicial debates unite hundreds of students across Russia.

The year 2019 was no exception: more than 450 students sent their applications for the participation, of which only the best 190 became the participants in the Debates. The teams competed among each other in several rounds, demonstrating their oratory, knowledge in various branches of law, and the ability to analyze legal facts.

The All-Russian Judicial Debates were covered in such media as the TV channel "Efir 24", the official portal of the Prosecutor's Office of the Republic of Tatarstan and the Supreme Court of the Republic of Tatarstan, as well as other sources.

Debates traditionally take place at the end of April and the whole event takes two busy days.

The opening of the event, which took place in the beautiful and oldest auditorium of Kazan University, was a starting point for this event. The first speaker to address the participants was the vice-rector for scientific activities of KFU *Denis Karlovich Nurgaliyev*, who gave the welcome speech, where he emphasized the importance of practice-oriented education. Then, the Dean of the Law Faculty of KFU *Liliya Talgatovna Bakulina* welcomed the participants. In addition, the Deputy Chairman of the Constitutional Court of the Republic of Tatarstan *Raisa Abdullovna Sakhieva* addressed the participants with greetings and good wishes as well as did the Deputy Chairman of the Supreme Court of the Republic of Tatarstan on civil matters *Lenar Arturovich Valishin*, Assistant at the Law Faculty of MSU *Elena Viktorovna Zaychenko*, Candidate of Legal Sciences, and Head of the Civil Procedure Department of the Law Institute of the Southern Federal University *Elena Sergeevna Smagina*, Candidate of Legal Sciences.

The administration of the Faculty and the honored guests expressed their sincere wishes to the participants: they wished them fruitful work, vivid discussions and expressed the hope that this celebration of science would make a real contribution to the integration between universities, and will help to establish contacts between scientific schools.

Later the participants were invited to attend informational and educational workshops for students from professionals in their field who shared their rich and

invaluable experience with the participants. This year there were offered three topics, three areas of law.

One of the workshops was devoted to the peculiarities of dealing with a certain categories of civil cases, and its headliner was the Chairman of the judicial panel, acting Deputy Chairman of the Supreme Court of the Republic of Tatarstan in civil matters *Lenar Arturovich Valishin*.

Second workshop was called “Model Contests in Constitutional Justice: Popularization of Reasoning Techniques and Personal Experience”. The speaker was *Sergey Sergeyevich Zaikin*, Candidate of Legal Sciences, Lecturer at Moscow State Law University, “Crystal Themis” Contest Judge, member of the editorial board of the scientific journal “Comparative Constitutional Review”, laureate of the 3rd prize at the competition of the Central Electoral Commission of the Russian Federation for the best work on the issues of electoral law and the electoral process, legal and political culture of voters (referendum participants), election organizers, election campaign participants.

The third workshop was devoted to criminal proceedings, where the representative of Kazan Garrison Military Court gave a paper on “The Basics of the Military Prosecutor’s Office”.

The first round of fights became the final chord of the first day. At Kazan Alma mater about thirty trials were taking place simultaneously for about two hours. The “battle” atmosphere prevailed in the auditoriums, it seemed that the spirit of rivalry was even in the air. At each of the sections students fiercely defended their point of view as highly qualified specialists in an atmosphere of heated discussion, bringing arguments in defense of their legal position. Practicing lawyers and judges acted as judges at the trials of the model process: *Vyacheslav Yuryevich Gussyakov* – Deputy Chairman of the International Union of Lawyers, judge emeritus; *Igor Nikolaevich Smolensky* – judge of the Commercial (Arbitrazh) Court of the Volga District; *Aydar Rustemovich Sultanov* – Head of the Legal Department of PJSC “Nizhnekamskneftekhim”; *Emil Amirovich Gataullin* and *Mikhail Grigorievich Raskin* – lawyers of the “Raskin and Partners” law firm; *Sergey Sergeevich Zaikin* – Candidate of Legal Sciences, Senior Lecturer at Kutafin Moscow State Law University; *Elena Sergeevna Smagina* – Head of the Department of Civil Procedure and Labor Law of the Law Faculty of the Southern Federal University; *Airat Damirovich Iskhakov* – Candidate of Legal Sciences, Associate Professor of the University of Prosecutor’s Office of the Russian Federation; *Rosaliya Zakiyevna Gayfutdinova* – Candidate of Legal Sciences, Associate Professor of the Law Faculty at Naberezhnye Chelny Institute (branch) of KFU; *Airat Ramilevich Davletshin* – alumnus of the “Judicial Debates” club; *Konstantin Valentinovich Egorov* – Director of the law firm “StroyCapitalConsulting”; *Ilgiz Abrarovich Khasanshin* – Candidate of Legal Sciences, judge of the Commercial (Arbitrazh) Court of the Republic of Tatarstan; *Igor Yuryevich Zagoruyko* – Doctor of Economic Sciences, Professor of Perm University; *Rafail Valievich Shakiryanov* – judge emeritus of the Supreme Court of the Republic of Tatarstan and *Yury Mikhailovich Lukin* – lawyer of the Advocate Bar of the Republic of

Tatarstan, Head of the Student Scientific Society of the Law Faculty at Kazan Federal University. This was the end of the official, educational and practical part of the first day of the event.

The second day of the All-Russian Judicial Debates began with the announcement of the results of the first round. The eyes of the participants were full of eager anticipation. After the results were announced, the semi-final of the model trial took place, where the best students could compete for the title of the finalists of the event. They were asked to complete written assignments. After a few hours, the teams that reached the final were announced – those who were only a step away from the final battle and a step away from the main prize – the statue of Themis.

The outcome of the day and the whole event was the closing ceremony, where the winners of the sections were awarded. The results of the prize draws organized together with the partners of the event were also announced at the ceremony.

Prizes in the sections were distributed as follows:

Civil Procedure:

1st place – Team A 43-19 Kazan (Volga region) Federal University,

Danil Vyacheslavovich Shadrin,

Ruslan Olegovich Nikolaev,

Aynur Ilgizovich Salakhov.

2nd place – Team A 18-19 Lomonosov Moscow State University.

3rd place – Team A 53-19 Higher School of Economics – National Research University – Saint Petersburg.

Criminal Procedure:

1st place – Team V 18-19 Kazan (Volga region) Federal University,

Vladislava Sergeevna Sycheva,

Anna Sergeevna Polovnikova,

Mikhail Yakovlevich Zhuk,

Emil Zagitovich Sultanov,

2nd place – Team V 07-19 Volga-Vyatka Institute of Kutafin Moscow State Law University.

3rd place – Team V 32-19 Crimean branch of the Russian State University of Justice.

Constitutional Procedure:

1st place – Team S 21-19 Financial University under the Government of the Russian Federation,

Sergey Vladimirovich Petukhov,

Roman Andronikovich Ambahtsumov,

Elena Vladimirovna Buzykina,

Anastasia Andreevna Solovyova,

2nd place – Team S 30-19 Ural State Law University.

3rd place – Team S 06-19 Ural State Law University.

Administrative Procedure:

1st place – Team D 14-19 Kazan (Volga region) Federal University,

Vladislav Viktorovich Anisimov,

Alexey Vladimirovich Bilalov,

2nd place – Team D 02-19 Saint-Petersburg Institute (branch) of the All-Russian State University of Justice (RLA of the Ministry of Justice of Russia).

3rd place – Team D 12-19 Southern Federal University.

Summarizing the above, we can safely say that the Debates significantly differ in format from the scientific and practical conferences and forums that students are used to. This is a one-of-a-kind project of the Law Faculty of Kazan (Volga Region) Federal University, inspired by the traditions of Kazan Law School and the trends of the new time.

The student model trial “All-Russian Judicial Debates” is one of the most effective and useful forms of teaching students, because it allows them to feel and experience not only the heat of emotions experienced by legal practitioners in their activities, but also the difficulties of the legal profession: namely preparing the legal argument, fending off the criticism of the opponent, drawing an impartial judge to their side, as well as experiencing the bitterness of defeat. However, speaking of defeat, it is worth noting that this event allows you to test your strength without fear of letting down your client. Thus, defeat in judicial debates is also a victory, a victory over oneself, because the defeat here is an impetus and impulse for further development in the professional sphere.

Summing up, it should be mentioned that the All-Russian Judicial Debates in 2019 were held in a new way, they have become more fruitful and more compelling. This year the Debates broke new ground, which, of course, has raised their status. Also, the informative and practice-oriented workshops were held for the first time. Thus, in two days the Debate participants acquired not only practical experience, public speaking skills, the ability to defend their position, but also gained new interesting acquaintances, positive and exciting emotions, as well as vivid impressions that will remain with them for life. A year later, the All-Russian Judicial Debates will again greet the students for new exciting “trials.” All-Russian Judicial Debates are not just an event, but a big and friendly family!

Information about the authors

Yuriy Lukin (Kazan, Russia) – Senior Professor, Department of Theory and History of State and Law, Project Chairman of the Student Scientific Society of the Law Faculty, Kazan (Volga region) Federal University, and practicing Attorney-at-law (420111, p/o box 627, for Lukin Yu.M.; e-mail: Yu.m.lukin@gmail.com).

Nikita Makolkin (Kazan, Russia) – Master student, Chairman of the Student Scientific Society of the Law Faculty, Kazan (Volga region) Federal University (Volga region) Federal University (Kazan, Kremlyovskaya st., 18; e-mail: nikita.makolkin@gmail.com).

Recommended citation

Lukin Yu.M., Makolkin N. N. Review of the XV annual student model trial “All-Russian Judicial Debates 2019”. *Kazan University Law Review*. 2019; 4 (2): 136–144. DOI: 10.30729/2541-8823-2019-4-2-136-144